Arguments for Dualism and Property Dualism

P.M. Churchland
Property Dualism

• “…the brain has special sort of properties possessed by no other kind of physical object. It is these special properties that are non physical…” (P.10)

• Having pain sensation, thinking, desiring, etc.
Epiphenomenon

• *Epi* (in Greek) – **above**

• certain level of complexity of brain process– the mind – **emerges**

• “mental phenomena are caused to occur by the various activities of the brain, *they do not have any causal effects in turn*. (p.11)
Interaction between Mental and Physical

- Mental (desire, decisions and volition) - action
- For *epiphenomenalist* this relation is an illusion
Dilemma

- **Origin** of the behaviour
- Behaviour **controlling** features
- **Brian** (motor cortex of the cerebrum)
- **Vs**
- Testimony of Introspection
- Desire, intention, and other mental phenomena
Interactionist Property Dualism

- Irreducibility of the mental phenomena
- Fundamental properties of the physical
- (mass, length, duration)
Religious Considerations

• Committed to the notion of immortality of soul

• The cause of the universe and the purpose of the universe

• Man’s place within the universe
Argument from Introspection

• Centre of our attention on the content of consciousness

• What is being apprehended?
  • Neural Networks, Electrochemical activity, etc.

• Flux of thoughts, Sensations, desire, emotion, etc.
Argument from Irreducibility

• Human ability to mental phenomena

• Human as linguistic being (ability to use language)

• Reason – the power of mathematical reason

• Introspectable qualities of thoughts and sensations - qualia

• Anticipate, predict the inexpressible experiences
Argument from parapsyholgy

- Telepathy (mind reading)
- Prerecognition (Seeing the future)
- Telekinesis (thought control of material objects)
- Clairvoyance (knowledge of distant objects)
- These above phenomena are real and existing on super-physical nature
Overall general considerations

• Scientific credentials of the religions and their religious authority is questioned.

• Rejection of geocentric view by Galileo
  – Microorganisms, physichochemical properties of the things, evolution, etc.

• Disease as punishment (visit by the devil)
  – Battle against religious prejudices
Rationality of Religious Conviction

• Social forces as the primary determinants of people’s belief
  – Christianity is centred around Europe and Americans
  – Hinduism in India
  – Islam in Africa and middle East
  – Buddhism in the Orient

• Professional philosophers and scientists keep themselves away from religious view
Introspection could be deeply suspected

• Does inner observation reveal things?
  – Sight, hearing, touch, etc. …
  – Red surface of apple does not look like a matrix of molecules reflecting photons at certain critical wavelengths…
  – Electrochemical states in the neural network…

  – Introspection cannot penetrate into hidden details
Argument of Irreducibility challenged

- Reason is not central to human thinking
- Reason (mathematical reasoning) can be created
- Computational mechanism displays the general principles of mathematical reasoning.
Argument from language is dubious

• Artificial languages are simpler in structure in comparison to natural language

• Complexity in terms of degree

• Language use by the physical system
Regarding Intrinsic qualities of sensations

• **Active research** programmes and positive suggestions can help us understanding them.

• **No Rhetoric**

• **Explanation** is necessary
For parapsychology

• Thinking as electromagnetic activity
  – Electromagnetic wave radiation at the speed of light
• Waves have effects on ‘radio transmitter/receiver)
  – Call it telepathy
Argument against Dualism

• Materialists rational methodology
  – Physical matter
  – Class of properties

• Opt for **simplicity**

• “Do not multiply entities beyond what is strictly necessary for explaining phenomena.”
  • William of Ockham
Availability of Explanatory devices

- Neuroscience
- fulfils the demands for simplicity
- Existing micro structure and causal relationship with the entire bodily organism
- Neurology
- (branch of medicine concerned with brain pathology)
About the Brain

• Trauma
• Recognition through neural devices
• Linguistic ability and learning
• Physical, chemical and electrical properties
• Physical laws
Philosophical Behaviourism

• Reaction against Dualism

• Philosophical behaviourism claims that any sentence about a mental state can be paraphrased, without loss of meaning, into a long and complex sentence about what observable behaviour would result if the person in question were in this, that, or the other observable circumstance. (p.23)
Influence of Logical Positivism

• Philosophical problems are the result of linguistic or conceptual confusion and are to be solved/ dissolved by careful analysis of the language in which the problems are expressed. (p.23)
Ryle’s Philosophical Analysis

• to understand the use of vocabulary / language

• Extraordinary capacity and dispositions

• For behaviourists, mind-body problem is a pseudoproblem
dispositions

• To be angry means to behave in an angry manner